



Procurement Form (FOR)

Effective Date:
5/1/2019

Document #:
FSA_PRO_FOR_0039

Revision Date:
N/A

Revision#:
0

Document Title:
Procurement Board Report-RFP

Document Owner/Department:
Procurement Team

Date: June 14, 2021

To: Sue McCormick, Chief Executive Officer

From: Daniel Edwards, Procurement Manager

Re: Procurement Report

General Information

Contract Number:	2004549	Project Owner:	Eric Kramp
Contract Title:	Lake Huron Water Treatment Plant – Flocculation Improvements		
Vendor:	CDM Smith Michigan, Inc.		
Budget:	Capital Project		

Procurement Method

Competitively bid – Request for Proposal (RFP) Qualification Based Selection (QBS) – Evaluation Committee

Advertised:	1-29-2021	Addendums released:	4
Buyer:	Gina Raju	Downloaded by:	127
Response due date:	4-7-2021	Responses received:	3

Cost Summary – CDM Smith Michigan, Inc.

Description	Proposed Cost	Negotiated Cost
Task 1 – Project Kickoff	\$35,009.00	\$35,009.00
Task 2 – Project Management	348,228.00	348,228.00
Task 3 – Study Phase	207,976.00	207,976.00
Task 4- Preliminary Design	1,098,618.00	1,098,618.00
Task 5 – Final Design	1,706,758.00	1,706,758.00
Task 6 - MI-EGLE Drinking Water Revolving Fund Loan Assistance	29,319.00	29,319.00
Task 7 - Bid Assistance	130,982.00	130,982.00
Task 8 -Construction Administration	1,256,617.00	1,256,617.00
Task 9 -Resident Project Representative	2,369,175.00	2,369,175.00
Task 10 -System O&M Manual Updated	87,129.00	87,129.00
Task 11- Provisional Allowance	600,000.00	600,000.00
Total Cost	\$7,869,811.00	\$7,869,811.00

Provisionary Allowance is an amount included in the Contract Price to reimburse the Contractor for the cost to furnish and perform Work that is uncertain. Any remaining balance upon Final Completion shall be retained by the GLWA and not paid to the Contractor.



Procurement Form (FOR)

Effective Date:
5/1/2019

Document #:
FSA_PRO_FOR_0039

Revision Date:
N/A

Revision#:
0

Document Title:
Procurement Board Report-RFP

Document Owner/Department:
Procurement Team

Per Procurement consultation with our Engineering partners, it was recommended to leave pricing as is, as to not diminish the quality of work for this project. CDM Smith, is providing a greater level of effort, realized in hours in comparison to the two other respondents. Comparison of hours and direct labor costs between all proposers is listed on the next page.



Procurement Form (FOR)

Effective Date:
5/1/2019

Document #:
FSA_PRO_FOR_0039

Revision Date:
N/A

Revision#:
0

Document Title:
Procurement Board Report-RFP

Document Owner/Department:
Procurement Team

RFP# 2004549 –Executive Summary of Hours and Direct Labor Costs

	CDM Smith Michigan		Hazen and Sawyer		Brown & Caldwell, LLC	
	Total Hours	Total Direct Labor Cost	Total Hours	Total Direct Labor Cost	Total Hours	Total Direct Labor Cost
Task 1 – Project Kickoff	138	\$10,951.00	456	\$24,344.00	406	\$25,526.00
Task 2 – Project Management	1,528	119,920.00	1,662	94,958.00	880	75,454.00
Task 3 – Study Phase	1,004	64,305.00	754	39,880.00	1,266	72,900.00
Task 4- Preliminary Design	5,245	309,251.00	2,774	145,974.00	4,320	231,817.00
Task 5 – Final Design	10,738	635,836.00	4,499	229,505.00	6,395	362,943.00
Task 6 - MI-EGLE Drinking Water Revolving Fund Loan Assistance	160	9,545.00	8	520.00	380	19,329.00
Task 7 - Bid Assistance	853	47,192.00	316	0.00	479	26,307.00
Task 8 - Construction Administration	5,783	386,247.00	4,514	244,968.00	2,334	135,698.00
Task 9 -Resident Project Representative	19,320	948,858.00	15,600	647,400.00	19,168	1,024,172.00
Task 10 -System O&M Manual Updated	358	26,047.00	613	35,015.00	360	32,159.00
Total	45,127	\$2,558,152.00	31,196	\$1,462,564.00	35,988	\$2,006,305.00
Average Direct Labor Cost Per Hour		\$56.69		\$46.88		\$55.75
Overhead Rate		176.3%		193%		173%



Procurement Form (FOR)

Effective Date:
5/1/2019

Document #:
FSA_PRO_FOR_0039

Revision Date:
N/A

Revision#:
0

Document Title:
Procurement Board Report-RFP

Document Owner/Department:
Procurement Team

Based on the above information, the comparison of hours shows that CDM is providing 44% more effort, realized in hours than Hazen and Sawyer and 26% more effort realized in hours than Brown and Caldwell, LLC. This level of effort is considered value added.

Benchmarking was completed by comparing the proposals for this project. This analysis confirmed that rates are in competitive range. The rate comparisons and allowances (if any) are illustrated in the attached cost tabulation.

Evaluation Committee: (Designation - Organization)

A - GLWA— Director

B - GLWA—Management Professional

C - GLWA—Management Professional

D - GLWA—Management Professional

E - GLWA— Manager

F - GLWA—Engineer

G - GLWA—Engineer

Evaluation Score(s) - Maximum Score Possible: 100

The Evaluation Committee independently reviewed and scored the proposals in accordance with GLWA's policy. The rankings are below.

Vendor (Highest to lowest score)	Score
CDM Smith Michigan, Inc.	73.91 pts.
Hazen and Sawyer	73.23 pts.
Brown and Caldwell, LLC	67.27 pts.



Procurement Form (FOR)

Effective Date:
5/1/2019

Document #:
FSA_PRO_FOR_0039

Revision Date:
N/A

Revision#:
0

Document Title:
Procurement Board Report-RFP

Document Owner/Department:
Procurement Team

Business Inclusion and Diversity (B.I.D.)*

- ☐ B.I.D. program required ☒ B.I.D. program not required
- ☐ The recommended vendor for award submitted a B.I.D. plan per the requirements under this solicitation.
- ☐ The recommended vendor for award did not submit a B.I.D. plan per the requirements under this solicitation.
- The vendor received points for the following scored criteria:
- ☐ Business presence in State of Michigan
- ☐ Business presence in GLWA service territory area (list the territory)
- ☐ Business presence in economically disadvantaged GLWA service territory area (list the territory)

*This item was advertised prior to the implementation of the B.I.D. process.

Other Data Requested by GLWA Board Members

Minority Business Enterprise (MBE): N/A
Small Business Enterprise (SBE): N/A
Woman Business Enterprise (WBE): N/A
Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE): N/A
Detroit Based Business (DBB): Yes
Other:

Sub-Contractor(s) List:

Somat Engineering, Inc.
Performance Environmental Services, Inc.
Spalding DeDecker
Clemson Engineering Hydraulics, LLC

Vendor Response Survey: N/A

Litigation

This vendor is not currently nor has been previously involved in any litigation with the GLWA.



Procurement Form (FOR)

Effective Date:
5/1/2019

Document #:
FSA_PRO_FOR_0039

Revision Date:
N/A

Revision#:
0

Document Title:
Procurement Board Report-RFP

Document Owner/Department:
Procurement Team

Financials

A financial risk assessment was performed by the GLWA via Dun & Bradstreet and was determined that the selected vendor has the financial capacity to perform the tasks under this contract. This information is available for the Board of Directors to review upon request.

Previous Contract

Previous contract holder: N/A