



Financial Services Group
Procurement
735 Randolph Street, Suite 1508
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Phone: 313-964-9157

Procurement Report

Date: February 18, 2019
To: Sue F. McCormick, Chief Executive Officer
From: Dan Edwards, Procurement Manager
Re: Procurement Report

General Information			
Contract Number:	1802774	Project Owner:	Peter Fromm
Contract Title:	Springwells Water Treatment Plant 1930 Sedimentation Basin Sluice Gates, Guides, and Hoist Improvements		
Vendor:	Kokosing Industrial, Inc.		
Budget:	Capital Project		
Contract Length:	Three (3) years		

Procurement Method

Competitively bid – Request for Proposal (RFP)			
Qualification Based Selection (QBS) – Evaluation Committee			
Advertised:	October 10, 2018	Addendums released:	3
Distributed to:	99	Downloaded by:	99
Response due date:	December 21, 2018	Responses received:	7

Evaluation and Scores

Evaluation Committee: (Designation – Organization)	
A – Manager, Procurement - GLWA	
B – Management Professional, Water Operations - GLWA	
C – Engineer, Water Operations - GLWA	
D – Engineer, Water Operations - GLWA	
E – Director, WRRF - GLWA	

The Evaluation Committee independently reviewed and scored the proposals in accordance with GLWA's policy. The rankings are below.



Financial Services Group
Procurement
 735 Randolph Street, Suite 1508
 Detroit, Michigan 48226
 Phone: 313-964-9157

Maximum Score Possible: 100		
Vendor (Highest to lowest score)	Score	Proposed Fee before Negotiations
Kokosing Industrial, Inc.	77.16	\$ 13,472,500.00
Barton Malow Company	74.32	14,366,246.00
Walsh Group	69.60	11,995,000.00
Weiss Construction Company, LLC	68.52	14,998,500.00
Commercial Contracting Corporation	63.80	10,998,000.00
CDM Smith Michigan, Inc.	63.24	13,918,888.00
Clark Construction Company	35.44	11,962,509.00

Fee Proposals Prior to Negotiations

Contract 1802774; Springwells Water Treatment Plant 1930 Sedimentation Basin Sluice Gates, Guides, and Hoist Improvements							
Task Number & Description	Kokosing Industrial, Inc.	Barton Malow Company	Walsh Group	Weiss Construction Company	Commercial Contracting Corporation	CDM Smith Michigan	Clark Construction Company
Task 1 - Project Management	\$1,710,000.00	\$2,406,185.00	\$2,183,217.00	\$1,710,000.00	\$910,000.00	\$2,544,000.00	\$1,144,821.00
Task 2 - 60% Detailed Design	\$360,000.00	\$464,625.00	\$349,831.00	\$1,125,000.00	\$239,000.00	\$455,400.00	\$411,943.00
Task 3 - 90% Detailed Design	\$255,000.00	\$204,750.00	\$191,490.00	\$185,000.00	\$70,000.00	\$237,600.00	\$106,051.00
Task 4 - 100% (Final) Detailed Design	\$65,000.00	\$36,750.00	\$151,556.00	\$42,500.00	\$20,000.00	\$79,200.00	\$52,017.00
Task 5 - General Construction	\$2,750,000.00	\$2,617,596.00	\$1,601,533.00	\$2,160,000.00	\$2,308,100.00	\$1,291,000.00	\$1,845,473.00
Task 6 - Mobilization	\$750,000.00	\$410,149.00	\$300,000.00	\$450,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$425,000.00	\$185,900.00
Task 7 - Demobilization	\$100,000.00	\$205,075.00	\$100,000.00	\$80,000.00	\$40,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$127,700.00
Task 8 - Expansion Joints	\$380,000.00	\$350,880.00	\$89,848.00	\$320,000.00	\$144,000.00	\$248,000.00	\$132,320.00
Task 9 - Shrinkage Crack Repair	\$9,000.00	\$7,798.00	\$8,283.00	\$13,000.00	\$3,400.00	\$7,400.00	\$3,066.00
Task 10 - Shallow Spalled Concrete Repair	\$32,500.00	\$28,170.00	\$32,010.00	\$75,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$60,000.00	\$18,375.00
Task 11 - Full Depth Concrete Repair	\$57,500.00	\$51,980.00	\$91,822.50	\$170,000.00	\$77,500.00	\$151,000.00	\$70,875.00
Task 12 - Deep Spalled Concrete Repair	\$37,500.00	\$34,655.00	\$72,132.50	\$140,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$108,000.00	\$27,565.00
Task 13 - Wall-to-Floor Crack Injection Repair	\$24,000.00	\$21,688.00	\$16,566.00	\$26,000.00	\$14,800.00	\$14,000.00	\$13,440.00
Task 14 - Crack Injection Repair	\$52,000.00	\$45,048.00	\$33,132.00	\$52,000.00	\$31,200.00	\$34,400.00	\$28,144.00
Task 15 - Furnishing Sluice Gates, Guides and Actuators	\$2,800,000.00	\$2,425,500.00	\$2,315,884.00	\$2,475,000.00	\$2,500,000.00	\$2,387,000.00	\$2,200,000.00
Task 16 - Installing Sluice Gates, Guides and Actuators	\$310,000.00	\$1,170,225.00	\$877,695.00	\$2,275,000.00	\$960,000.00	\$2,044,488.00	\$1,965,115.00
Task 17 - Construction Safety Management	\$380,000.00	\$485,172.00	\$180,000.00	\$300,000.00	\$180,000.00	\$382,400.00	\$229,704.00
Task 18 - Provisional Allowance	\$3,000,000.00	\$3,000,000.00	\$3,000,000.00	\$3,000,000.00	\$3,000,000.00	\$3,000,000.00	\$3,000,000.00
Task 19 - GLWA Security Allowance	\$400,000.00	\$400,000.00	\$400,000.00	\$400,000.00	\$400,000.00	\$400,000.00	\$400,000.00
	\$13,472,500.00	\$14,366,246.00	\$11,995,000.00	\$14,998,500.00	\$10,998,000.00	\$13,918,888.00	\$11,962,509.00



Financial Services Group
Procurement
 735 Randolph Street, Suite 1508
 Detroit, Michigan 48226
 Phone: 313-964-9157

Negotiated Fee Schedule

KOKOSING INDUSTRIAL, INC.				
Description		Negotiated Reduction	Additional Scope	Revised Fee
Task 1 – Project Management	\$1,710,000.00	\$(410,000.00)	-----	1,300,000.00
Task 2 – 60% Detailed Design	\$360,000.00	-----	\$10,000.00	370,000.00
Task 3 – 90% Detailed Design	\$255,000.00	(30,000.00)	-----	225,000.00
Task 4 – 100% (Final) Detailed Design	\$65,000.00	-----	110,000.00	175,000.00
Task 5 – General Construction	\$2,750,000.00	(464,500.00)	-----	2,285,500.00
Task 6 - Mobilization	\$750,000.00	(350,000.00)	-----	400,000.00
Task 7 - Demobilization	\$100,000.00	(50,000.00)	-----	50,000.00
Task 8 – Expansion Joints	\$380,000.00	-----	-----	380,000.00
Task 9 – Shrinkage Crack Repair	\$9,000.00	-----	-----	9,000.00
Task 10 – Shallow Spalled Concrete Repair	\$32,500.00	-----	-----	32,500.00
Task 11 – Full Depth Concrete Repair	\$57,500.00	-----	-----	57,500.00
Task 12 – Deep Spalled Concrete Repair	\$37,500.00	-----	-----	37,500.00
Task 13 – Wall-To-Floor Crack Injection Repair	\$24,000.00	-----	-----	24,000.00
Task 14 – Crack Injection Repair	\$52,000.00	-----	-----	52,000.00
Task 15 – Furnishing Sluice Gates, Guides and Actuators	\$2,800,000.00	(150,000.00)	-----	2,650,000.00
Task 16 – Installing Sluice Gates, Guides and Actuators	\$310,000.00	-----	250,000.00	560,000.00
Task 17 – Construction Safety Management	\$380,000.00	-----	-----	380,000.00
Task 18 – Provisional Allowance	\$3,000,000.00	-----	-----	3,000,000.00
Task 19 – GLWA Security Allowance	\$400,000.00	-----	-----	400,000.00
Task 20 – Allowance for Sediment Basin Stairs	-----	-----	125,000.00	125,000.00
Task 21 – Allowance to Provide 24/7 Operations During Outages	-----	-----	550,000.00	550,000.00
Task 22 – Allowance for Temporary Bulkheads	-----	(200,000.00)	-----	(200,000.00)
Task 23 – Allowance to Remove and Replace Gate Wall Thimbles	-----	-----	840,000.00	840,000.00
	\$13,472,500.00	(\$1,654,500.00)	\$1,885,000.00	\$13,703,000.00



Financial Services Group

Procurement

735 Randolph Street, Suite 1508

Detroit, Michigan 48226

Phone: 313-964-9157

Benchmarking was completed by comparing the proposals for this project. This analysis confirmed that rates are in competitive range. The rate comparisons and allowances (if any) are illustrated below.

Provisionary Allowance is an amount included in the Contract Price to reimburse the Consultant for the cost to furnish and perform Work that is uncertain. Any remaining balance upon Final Completion shall be retained by the GLWA and not paid to the Consultant.

Benchmarking was completed by analyzing the level of effort required for this project and industry standard rates along with comparing the proposals received for this project. The results confirmed that rates are in competitive range. The rate comparisons and allowances (if any) are illustrated in the attached document labeled cost tabulation.

Other Data Requested by GLWA Board Members

Minority Business Enterprise (MBE): No

Detroit Based Business (DBB): No

Small Business Enterprise (SBE): No

Sub-Contractor(s) List:

Alfred Benesch & Company

Arcadis

NTH Consultants LTD

Vendor Response Survey: N/A

Litigation

This vendor is not currently nor has been previously involved in any litigation with the GLWA.

Financials

A financial risk assessment was performed by the GLWA via Dun & Bradstreet and was determined that the selected vendor has the financial capacity to perform the tasks under this contract. This information is available for the Board of Directors to review upon request.