|  | Procurement Form (FOR) |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  | Effective Date: <br> $5 / 1 / 2019$ | Document \#: <br> FSA_PRO_FOR_0039 | Revision Date: <br> $4 / 5 / 2023$ | Revision\#: <br> 2 |
|  | Document Owner/Department: <br> Procurement Team |  |  |  |

## - 2204729a Cost Summary - Rate Comparison

## Negotiated Cost Schedule

Benchmarking was completed by comparing the proposals for this project. This analysis confirmed that rates are in competitive range. The rate comparisons and allowances (if any) are illustrated in the attached cost tabulation.

|  | Description | Birclar Electric | Birclar Electric Negotiated Cost | Ideal Electric Power Co. <br> - Proposed Cost | Ideal Electric Power Co. - <br> Negotiated Cost |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Task 1 | Motors - Diagnosis, Repair \& Reconditioning | Equipment \& Repairs | Equipment \& Repairs | Equipment \& Repairs | Equipment \& Repairs |
| 1-1 | Motor - 2 Speed | \$ 3,686.00 | \$ 3,686.00 | \$ 9,623.11 | \$ 9,623.11 |
| 1-2 | Motor - Induction | 3,686.00 | 3,686.00 | 9,004.61 | 9,004.61 |
| 1-3 | Motor - Induction - VFD Controlled | 6,601.00 | 6,601.00 | 8,542.53 | 8,542.53 |
| 1-4 | Motor - Synchronous | 9,672.00 | 9,672.00 | 11,674.64 | 11,674.64 |
| 1-5 | Motor - Induction - VFD Controlled | 7,282.00 | 7,282.00 | 10,527.98 | 10,527.98 |
| 1-6 | Motor - Induction - VFD Controlled | 7,980.00 | 7,980.00 | 10,217.39 | 10,217.39 |
| 1-7 | Motor - Synchronous | 10,788.00 | 10,788.00 | 13,758.29 | 13,758.29 |
| 1-8 | Motor - Induction - VFD Controlled | 8,282.00 | 8,282.00 | 12,087.02 | 12,087.02 |
| 1-9 | Motor - Synchronous | 10,974.00 | 10,974.00 | 16,107.29 | 16,107.29 |
| 1-10 | Motor - Synchronous | 11,904.00 | 11,904.00 | 20,355.50 | 20,355.50 |
| 1-11 | Motor - Synchronous | 12,152.00 | 12,152.00 | 29,663.41 | 29,663.41 |
| 1-12 | Motor - Induction - VFD Controlled | 17,320.00 | 17,320.00 | 20,729.60 | 20,729.60 |
| 1-13 | Motor - Synchronous | 18,033.00 | 18,033.00 | 23,662.37 | 23,662.37 |
| 1-14 | Motor - Synchronous | 18,033.00 | 18,033.00 | 25,706.00 | 25,706.00 |
| 1-15 | Motor - Synchronous | 18,033.00 | 18,033.00 | 25,615.52 | 25,615.52 |
| 1-16 | Motor - Induction - VFD Controlled | 18,583.00 | 18,583.00 | 20,184.72 | 20,184.72 |
| 1-17 | Motor - Synchronous | 19,555.00 | 19,555.00 | 27,945.38 | 27,945.38 |
| 1-18 | Motor - Synchronous | 19,555.00 | 19,555.00 | 31,141.76 | 31,141.76 |
| 1-19 | Motor - Synchronous | 19,555.00 | 19,555.00 | 23,590.16 | 23,590.16 |
| 1-20 | Motor - Synchronous | 19,555.00 | 19,555.00 | 23,590.77 | 23,590.77 |

Effective Date:
5/1/2019

Document \#:
FSA_PRO_FOR_0039

Revision Date:
4/5/2023

Revision\#:
2

## Document Title:

Procurement Board Report-RFP

## Document Owner/Department:

Procurement Team

|  | Description | Birclar Electric | Birclar Electric Negotiated Cost | Ideal Electric Power Co. <br> - Proposed Cost | Ideal Electric Power Co. Negotiated Cost |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1-21 | Motor - Synchronous | 19,555.00 | 19,555.00 | 41,343.16 | 41,343.16 |
| 1-22 | Motor - Synchronous | 20,708.00 | 20,708.00 | 34,105.85 | 34,105.85 |
| 1-23 | Motor - Synchronous | 20,708.00 | 20,708.00 | 30,826.82 | 30,826.82 |
| 1-24 | Motor - Synchronous | 20,708.00 | 20,708.00 | 30,826.82 | 30,826.82 |
| 1-25 | Motor - Synchronous | 20,708.00 | 20,708.00 | 30,613.67 | 30,613.67 |
| 1-26 | Motor - Synchronous | 37,870.00 | 37,870.00 | 45,399.54 | 45,399.54 |
| 1-27 | Motor - Synchronous | 23,436.00 | 23,436.00 | 36,748.04 | 36,748.04 |
| 1-28 | Motor - Synchronous | 23,436.00 | 23,436.00 | 36,176.45 | 36,176.45 |
| 1-29 | Motor - Synchronous | 23,436.00 | 23,436.00 | 32,435.45 | 32,435.45 |
| 1-30 | Motor - Synchronous | 29,760.00 | 29,760.00 | 42,170.75 | 42,170.75 |
| 1-31 | Motor - Synchronous | 29,760.00 | 29,760.00 | 38,553.29 | 38,553.29 |
| 1-32 | Motor - Synchronous | 29,760.00 | 29,760.00 | 47,202.83 | 47,202.83 |
| 1-33 | Motor - Synchronous | 29,760.00 | 29,760.00 | 43,527.95 | 43,527.95 |
| 1-34 | Motor - Synchronous | 31,124.00 | 31,124.00 | 42,138.56 | 42,138.56 |
| 1-35 | Motor - Synchronous | 33,232.00 | 33,232.00 | 41,791.43 | 41,791.43 |
| 1-36 | Motor - Synchronous | 44,020.00 | 44,020.00 | 70,949.95 | 70,949.95 |
| 1-37 | Motor - Induction - VFD Controlled | 46,376.00 | 46,376.00 | 70,949.95 | 70,949.95 |
| 1-38 | Motor - Synchronous | 23,436.00 | 23,436.00 | 51,833.33 | 51,833.33 |
| Task 2 | Motors - Stator Rewinding | Equipment \& Repairs | Equipment \& Repairs | Equipment \& Repairs | Equipment \& Repairs |
| 2-1 | Motor - 2 Speed | 10,023.00 | 10,023.00 | 20,410.14 | 20,410.14 |
| 2-2 | Motor - Induction | 10,023.00 | 10,023.00 | 18,350.93 | 18,350.93 |
| 2-3 | Motor - Induction - VFD Controlled | 10,023.00 | 10,023.00 | 16,808.42 | 16,808.42 |
| 2-4 | Motor - Synchronous | 22,568.00 | 22,568.00 | 27,251.12 | 27,251.12 |
| 2-5 | Motor - Induction - VFD Controlled | 10,023.00 | 10,023.00 | 23,426.60 | 23,426.60 |
| 2-6 | Motor - Induction - VFD Controlled | 11,694.00 | 11,694.00 | 22,391.30 | 22,391.30 |
| 2-7 | Motor - Synchronous | 13,833.00 | 13,833.00 | 34,195.46 | 34,195.46 |
| 2-8 | Motor - Induction - VFD Controlled | 14,285.00 | 14,285.00 | 28,624.85 | 28,624.85 |


|  | Procurement Form (FOR) |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Effective Date: $5 / 1 / 2019$ | Document \#: <br> FSA_PRO_FOR_0039 | Revision Date: $4 / 5 / 2023$ | Revision\#: $2$ |
| Document Title: <br> Procurement Board Report-RFP Document Owner/Department: <br> Procurement Team |  |  |  |  |


|  | Description | Birclar Electric | Birclar Electric Negotiated Cost | Ideal Electric Power Co. <br> - Proposed Cost | Ideal Electric Power Co. - <br> Negotiated Cost |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2-9 | Motor - Synchronous | 29,870.00 | 29,870.00 | 42,025.46 | 42,025.46 |
| 2-10 | Motor - Synchronous | 29,512.00 | 29,512.00 | 56,185.58 | 56,185.58 |
| 2-11 | Motor - Synchronous | 29,512.00 | 29,512.00 | 87,212.83 | 87,212.83 |
| 2-12 | Motor - Induction - VFD Controlled | 39,600.00 | 39,600.00 | 57,434.03 | 57,434.03 |
| 2-13 | Motor - Synchronous | 48,087.00 | 48,087.00 | 67,209.35 | 67,209.35 |
| 2-14 | Motor - Synchronous | 67,785.00 | 67,785.00 | 74,021.45 | 74,021.45 |
| 2-15 | Motor - Synchronous | 67,785.00 | 67,785.00 | 73,719.56 | 73,719.56 |
| 2-16 | Motor - Induction - VFD Controlled | 67,785.00 | 67,785.00 | 55,615.73 | 55,615.73 |
| 2-17 | Motor - Synchronous | 78,068.00 | 78,068.00 | 81,428.63 | 81,428.63 |
| 2-18 | Motor - Synchronous | 78,068.00 | 78,068.00 | 92,140.94 | 92,140.94 |
| 2-19 | Motor - Synchronous | 78,068.00 | 78,068.00 | 66,969.23 | 66,969.23 |
| 2-20 | Motor - Synchronous | 78,068.00 | 78,068.00 | 66,969.23 | 66,969.23 |
| 2-21 | Motor - Synchronous | 78,068.00 | 78,068.00 | 126,144.24 | 126,144.24 |
| 2-22 | Motor - Synchronous | 95,358.00 | 88,752.00 | 102,021.53 | 102,021.53 |
| 2-23 | Motor - Synchronous | 95,358.00 | 88,942.00 | 91,091.72 | 91,091.72 |
| 2-24 | Motor - Synchronous | 95,358.00 | 90,681.00 | 91,091.72 | 91,091.72 |
| 2-25 | Motor - Synchronous | 95,358.00 | 90,903.00 | 90,378.32 | 90,378.32 |
| 2-26 | Motor - Synchronous | 118,760.00 | 111,635.00 | 139,655.34 | 139,655.34 |
| 2-27 | Motor - Synchronous | 121,565.00 | 118,754.00 | 110,827.67 | 110,827.67 |
| 2-28 | Motor - Synchronous | 121,565.00 | 116,521.00 | 108,923.24 | 108,923.24 |
| 2-29 | Motor - Synchronous | 121,565.00 | 118,749.00 | 96,452.66 | 96,452.66 |
| 2-30 | Motor - Synchronous | 121,565.00 | 119,830.00 | 128,904.53 | 128,904.53 |
| 2-31 | Motor - Synchronous | 121,565.00 | 119,854.00 | 116,846.33 | 116,846.33 |
| 2-32 | Motor - Synchronous | 121,565.00 | 121,565.00 | 145,676.39 | 145,676.39 |
| 2-33 | Motor - Synchronous | 121,565.00 | 121,565.00 | 133,428.53 | 133,428.53 |
| 2-34 | Motor - Synchronous | 126,470.00 | 126,470.00 | 128,794.91 | 128,794.91 |
| 2-35 | Motor - Synchronous | 126,470.00 | 126,470.00 | 130,539.26 | 130,539.26 |
| 2-36 | Motor - Synchronous | 542,500.00 | 519,943.00 | 224,833.17 | 224,833.17 |


|  | Procurement Form (FOR) |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Great Lakes Water Authority | Effective Date: $5 / 1 / 2019$ | Document \#: <br> FSA_PRO_FOR_0039 | Revision Date: $4 / 5 / 2023$ | Revision\#: $2$ |
| Document Title: <br> Procurement Board Report-RFP |  |  | Document Owner/Department: <br> Procurement Team |  |


|  | Description | Birclar Electric | Birclar Electric <br> Negotiated Cost | Ideal Electric Power Co. <br> - Proposed Cost | Ideal Electric Power Co. - <br> Negotiated Cost |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2-37 | Motor - Induction - VFD Controlled | 464,380.00 | 453,794.00 | 224,833.17 | 224,833.17 |
| 2-38 | Motor - Synchronous | 121,565.00 | 121,565.00 | 161,112.68 | 161,112.68 |
| Task 3 | Motors - Rotor Rewinding | Equipment \& Repairs | Equipment \& Repairs | Equipment \& Repairs | Equipment \& Repairs |
| 3-1 | Motor - Synchronous | 34,998.00 | 34,998.00 | 27,251.12 | 27,251.12 |
| 3-2 | Motor - Synchronous | 68,101.00 | 68,101.00 | 34,195.46 | 34,195.46 |
| 3-3 | Motor - Synchronous | 73,470.00 | 73,470.00 | 42,025.46 | 42,025.46 |
| 3-4 | Motor - Synchronous | 82,336.00 | 82,336.00 | 56,185.58 | 56,185.58 |
| 3-5 | Motor - Synchronous | 88,164.00 | 88,164.00 | 87,212.83 | 87,212.83 |
| 3-6 | Motor - Synchronous | 124,153.00 | 124,153.00 | 67,209.35 | 67,209.35 |
| 3-7 | Motor - Synchronous | 117,000.00 | 117,000.00 | 74,021.45 | 74,021.45 |
| 3-8 | Motor - Synchronous | 175,500.00 | 175,500.00 | 73,719.56 | 73,719.56 |
| 3-9 | Motor - Synchronous | 117,000.00 | 117,000.00 | 81,428.63 | 81,428.63 |
| 3-10 | Motor - Synchronous | 136,500.00 | 136,500.00 | 92,140.94 | 92,140.94 |
| 3-11 | Motor - Synchronous | 103,375.00 | 103,375.00 | 66,969.23 | 66,969.23 |
| 3-12 | Motor - Synchronous | 103,375.00 | 103,375.00 | 66,969.23 | 66,969.23 |
| 3-13 | Motor - Synchronous | 227,425.00 | 211,355.00 | 126,144.24 | 126,144.24 |
| 3-14 | Motor - Synchronous | 144,725.00 | 144,725.00 | 102,021.53 | 102,021.53 |
| 3-15 | Motor - Synchronous | 124,050.00 | 124,050.00 | 91,091.72 | 91,091.72 |
| 3-16 | Motor - Synchronous | 124,050.00 | 124,050.00 | 91,091.72 | 91,091.72 |
| 3-17 | Motor - Synchronous | 144,725.00 | 144,725.00 | 90,378.32 | 90,378.32 |
| 3-18 | Motor - Synchronous | 232,375.00 | 232,375.00 | 139,655.34 | 139,655.34 |
| 3-19 | Motor - Synchronous | 155,312.00 | 155,312.00 | 110,827.67 | 110,827.67 |
| 3-20 | Motor - Synchronous | 257,115.00 | 231,459.00 | 108,923.24 | 108,923.24 |
| 3-21 | Motor - Synchronous | 257,115.00 | 231,429.00 | 96,452.66 | 96,452.66 |
| 3-22 | Motor - Synchronous | 304,606.00 | 280,192.00 | 128,904.53 | 128,904.53 |
| 3-23 | Motor - Synchronous | 278,008.00 | 253,916.00 | 116,846.33 | 116,846.33 |
| 3-24 | Motor - Synchronous | 305,598.00 | 280,138.00 | 145,676.39 | 145,676.39 |

## Procurement Form (FOR)

| Effective Date: <br> $5 / 1 / 2019$ | Document \#: <br> FSA_PRO_FOR_0039 | Revision Date: <br> $4 / 5 / 2023$ | Revision\#: <br> 2 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

## Document Title:

Procurement Board Report-RFP

## Document Owner/Department:

Procurement Team

|  | Description | Birclar Electric | Birclar Electric <br> Negotiated Cost | Ideal Electric Power Co. <br> - Proposed Cost | Ideal Electric Power Co. Negotiated Cost |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 3-25 | Motor - Synchronous | 290,706.00 | 276,170.00 | 133,428.53 | 133,428.53 |
| 3-26 | Motor - Synchronous | 323,282.00 | 287,619.00 | 128,794.91 | 128,794.91 |
| 3-27 | Motor - Synchronous | 313,175.00 | 294,384.00 | 130,539.26 | 130,539.26 |
| 3-28 | Motor - Synchronous | 387,540.00 | 353,516.00 | 224,833.17 | 224,833.17 |
| 3-29 | Motor - Synchronous | 246,310.00 | 246,310.00 | 161,112.68 | 161,112.68 |
| Task 4 | Hourly Rates - Motor Diagnosis, Repair \& Reconditioning | Labor Rates Per Hour | Labor Rates Per Hour | Labor Rates Per Hour | Labor Rates Per Hour |
| 4-1 | Straight-time field labor to uninstall, reinstall or service motors at GLWA's facilities | 138.00 | 138.00 | 165.00 | 165.00 |
| 4-2 | Overtime field labor to uninstall, reinstall or service motors at GLWA's facilities | 165.00 | 165.00 | 250.00 | 250.00 |
| 4-3 | Field service engineer straight-time for motor installation, supervision, and start-up at GLWA's facilities. | 186.00 | 176.00 | 165.00 | 165.00 |
| 4-4 | Field service engineer overtime for motor installation, supervision, and start-up at GLWA's facilities. | 211.00 | 195.00 | 250.00 | 250.00 |
| 4-5 | Straight-time shop labor for GLWA-authorized extra work on motors. | 120.00 | 120.00 | 123.50 | 123.50 |
| 4-6 | Overtime shop labor for GLWA-authorized extra work on motors. | 148.00 | 148.00 | 185.25 | 185.25 |
| Task 5 | Hourly Rates - Stator Rewinding | Labor Rates per Hour | Labor Rates per Hour | Labor Rates per Hour | Labor Rates per Hour |
| 5-1 | Straight-time field labor to uninstall, reinstall or service motors at GLWA's facilities | 138.00 | 138.00 | 165.00 | 165.00 |
| 5-2 | Overtime field labor to uninstall, reinstall or service motors at GLWA's facilities | 165.00 | 165.00 | 250.00 | 250.00 |

## Procurement Form (FOR)

| Effective Date: <br> 5/1/2019 | Document \#: <br> FSA_PRO_FOR_0039 | Revision Date: <br> $4 / 5 / 2023$ | Revision\#: <br> 2 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

## Document Title:

Procurement Board Report-RFP

## Document Owner/Department:

Procurement Team

|  | Description | Birclar Electric | Birclar Electric <br> Negotiated Cost | Ideal Electric Power Co. <br> - Proposed Cost | Ideal Electric Power Co. Negotiated Cost |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5-3 | Field service engineer straight-time for motor consulting, installation, supervision, and start-up at GLWA's facilities. | 186.00 | 176.00 | 165.00 | 165.00 |
| 5-4 | Field service engineer overtime for motor, installation, supervision, and start-up at GLWA's facilities. | 211.00 | 195.00 | 250.00 | 250.00 |
| 5-5 | Straight-time shop labor for GLWA-authorized extra work on motors. | 120.00 | 120.00 | 123.50 | 123.50 |
| 5-6 | Overtime shop labor for GLWA-authorized extra work on motors. | 148.00 | 148.00 | 185.25 | 185.25 |
| Task 6 | Hourly Rates - Rotor Rewinding |  |  |  |  |
| 6-1 | Straight-time field labor to uninstall, reinstall or service motors at GLWA's facilities | 138.00 | 138.00 | 165.00 | 165.00 |
| 6-2 | Overtime field labor to uninstall, reinstall or service motors at GLWA's facilities | 165.00 | 165.00 | 250.00 | 250.00 |
| 6-3 | Field service engineer straight-time for motor consulting, installation, supervision, and start-up at GLWA's facilities. | 186.00 | 176.00 | 165.00 | 165.00 |
| 6-4 | Field service engineer overtime for motor consulting, installation, supervision, and start-up at GLWA's facilities. | 211.00 | 195.00 | 250.00 | 250.00 |
| 6-5 | Straight-time shop labor for GLWA-authorized extra work on motors. | 120.00 | 120.00 | 123.50 | 123.50 |
| 6-6 | Overtime shop labor for GLWA-authorized extra work on motors. | 148.00 | 148.00 | 185.25 | 185.25 |
| Task 7 | Allowances | Allowances | Allowances | Allowances | Allowances |
| 7-1 | Allowance for emergency services, extra services and parts authorized by GLWA (enter $\$ 100,000.00$ ) | 100,000.00 |  |  |  |


|  | Procurement Form (FOR) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Effective Date: 5/1/2019 | Document \#: <br> FSA_PRO_FOR_0039 | Revision Date:4/5/2023 |  | Revision\#:$2$ |  |  |  |  |
| Document Title: <br> Procurement Board Report-RFP |  |  | Document Owner/Department: Procurement Team |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Description |  |  | Birclar Electric | Birclar Electric Negotiated Cost |  |  | ric Power Co. Cost | Ideal Electric <br> Power Co. <br> Negotiated Cost |  |
| This is a unit cost project. There are no minimums or maximums guaranteed |  |  |  |  | 100,000.00 |  | 100,000.00 |  | 100,000.00 |
|  |  |  | 10,504,391.00 | \$ | 10,166,660.00 | \$ | 8,251,094.18 | \$ | 8,251,094.18 |

Provisionary Allowance is an amount included in the Contract Price to reimburse the Contractor for the cost to furnish and perform Work that is uncertain. Any remaining balance upon Final Completion shall be retained by the GLWA and not paid to the Contractor.

