



**Financial Services**

**Procurement**

735 Randolph Street, Suite 1508

Detroit, Michigan 48226

Phone: 313-964-9157

**Procurement Report**

**Date: November 27, 2019**

**To: Sue McCormick, Chief Executive Officer**

**From: Dan Edwards, Procurement Manager**

**Re: Procurement Report**

General Information			
Contract Number:	1900134	Project Owner:	Jacob Mangum
Contract Title:	Springwells Water Treatment Plant Low Lift Suction Gate Replacement		
Vendor:	Barton Malow Company		
Budget:	Capital Project		
Contract Length:	730 Days		

**Procurement Method**

Competitively bid – Request for Proposal (RFP) Qualification Based Selection (QBS) – Evaluation Committee			
Advertised:	05/17/2019	Addenda released:	4
Distributed to:	84	Downloaded by:	84
Response due date:	07/26/2019	Responses received:	5

**Negotiated Cost Schedule**

Barton Malow Company		
Description	Original Proposal	Negotiated
Task 1 - General Requirements	\$ 511,945.00	\$ 511,945.00
Task 2 - Mobilization/Demobilization	505,702.00	505,702.00
Task 3 - Project Management	1,006,303.00	1,006,303.00
Task 4 - Facility Cleaning/Debris Removal	90,174.00	90,174.00
Task 5 - Field Verification of Existing Conditions	12,868.00	12,868.00
Task 6 - Anchor Pull Test	53,067.00	53,067.00
Task 7 - 90% Detailed Design	119,830.00	119,830.00
Task 8 - 100% (Final) Detailed Design	32,603.00	32,603.00
Task 9 - Furnishing Roller Gates, Guides, Frames and Appurtenances	3,381,525.00	3,381,525.00
Task 10-Installing Roller Gates, Guides, Frames and Appurtenances	3,059,233.00	3,409,233.00
Task 11-Furnishing Drain Valves	257,355.00	257,355.00
Task 12-Installing Drain Valves	178,453.00	178,453.00
Task 13-Furnishing Bulkhead Style Gates, Guides Appurtenances	710,120.00	685,120.00



**Financial Services**

**Procurement**

735 Randolph Street, Suite 1508

Detroit, Michigan 48226

Phone: 313-964-9157

**Negotiated Cost Schedule (Continued)**

Barton Malow Company		
Description	Original Proposal	Negotiated
Task 14 – Installing Bulkhead Style Gates, Guides and Appurtenances	\$ 730,769.00	\$ 730,769.00
Task 15 – General Construction	622,824.00	622,824.00
Task 16 – Dive Cancellation	140,700.00	140,700.00
Task 17 – Construction Safety Management	245,050.00	245,050.00
Task 18 – Provisionary Allowance (\$1,500,000.00)	1,500,000.00	1,500,000.00
Task 19 – GLWA Security Allowance	250,000.00	250,000.00
Task 20 - Alternate Shutdown	(-\$141,120.00)	(-\$141,120.00)
Totals	\$ 13,267,401.00	\$ 13,733,521.00

*Provisionary Allowance is an amount included in the Contract Price to reimburse the Consultant for the cost to furnish and perform Work that is uncertain. Any remaining balance upon Final Completion shall be retained by the GLWA and not paid to the Consultant.*

Benchmarking was completed by comparing the proposals for this project. This analysis confirmed that rates are in competitive range. The rate comparisons and allowances (if any) are illustrated in the attached document labeled cost tabulation.

**Evaluation and Scores**

Evaluation Committee: (Designation – Organization)
A – GLWA - Engineer
B – GLWA - Engineer
C – GLWA - Management Professional
D – GLWA - Engineer
E – GLWA - Manager



**Financial Services**  
**Procurement**  
735 Randolph Street, Suite 1508  
Detroit, Michigan 48226  
Phone: 313-964-9157

The Evaluation Committee independently reviewed and scored the proposals in accordance with GLWA's policy. The rankings are below.

Maximum Score Possible:		
<b>Vendor (Highest to lowest score)</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Proposed Cost before Negotiations</b>
<b>Barton Malow Company</b>	<b>77.65</b>	<b>\$ 13,267,401.00</b>
<b>Ballard Marine Construction, LLC</b>	<b>73.17</b>	<b>20,645,453.00</b>
<b>Walsh Group</b>	<b>70.37</b>	<b>19,200,000.28</b>
<b>Kokosing Industrial, Inc.</b>	<b>69.57</b>	<b>16,983,000.00</b>
<b>Clark Construction Company</b>	<b>47.95</b>	<b>12,683,346.00</b>

#### **Other Data Requested by GLWA Board Members**

Minority Business Enterprise (MBE): No  
Detroit Based Business (DBB): No  
Small Business Enterprise (SBE): No

Sub-Contractor(s) List:

J.F. Cavanaugh  
Titus Welding Company  
Underwater Construction Corporation  
Wade Trim

Vendor Response Survey: N/A

#### **Litigation**

This vendor is not currently nor has been previously involved in any litigation with the GLWA.

#### **Financials**

A financial risk assessment was performed by the GLWA via Dun & Bradstreet and was determined that the selected vendor has the financial capacity to perform the tasks under this contract. This information is available for the Board of Directors to review upon request.

#### **Previous Contract**

Previous contract holder: N/A